

	HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT	AGENDA # _____
---	--	-----------------------

TO: CASA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

FROM: Jaclyn Sarnowski, City Planner

MEETING DATE: July 26, 2021

SUBJECT: **DSA-21-00113: Local Historic Landmark Sign Designation – Elks Lodge Signs**

REQUEST

DSA-21-00113: Request by the Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge #1957 to designate the “Elks Lodge Signs” located at 909 E. Florence Blvd as a **Local Historic Sign Landmark**.

APPLICANT/OWNER INFORMATION

<u>Applicant</u> Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge #1957 909 E. Florence Blvd Casa Grande, AZ 85122 P: 520.836.7083	<u>Owner</u> Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks 2750 N. Lakeview Ave Chicago, IL 60614 P: 773.755.4700
---	---

HISTORY

- March 5, 1915: The site was annexed into the City limits of Casa Grande.
- 1957: Per Pinal County Records, the existing building was constructed.
- May 1969: The site was zoned R-2 (Multiple Family) according to the zoning map.
- November 2, 1987: The property was zoned R-1 (Single-Family Residential) with the adoption of the official zoning ordinance and map.
- July 20, 2015: The City Council approved a zone change from R-1 (Single-Family Residential) to B-2 (General Business) (DSA-15-00055).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Background

The Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge #1957 signs have been in its existing location since 1957. The site has four signs that were surveyed as part of the 2016 Sign Survey. These include: “Elks” script letters on the façade; “BPOE” letters on the side – both backlit channel letters; painted cast concrete “BPOE 1957” medallion; and a freestanding metal box with a circular on top of rectangular on post (see below).



Per the General Plan 2030, the Historic Preservation Element is intended to guide Casa Grande's efforts to protect and preserve the historic, architectural, cultural, and archaeological resources of the community. One of the goals of this Element is "Building community-wide awareness and support for the City's Historic Preservation efforts." (*Goal HP-3*). By expanding the City's designation of Landmarks to include signs, this increases additional sites that are being preserved and hence will expand awareness of Historic Preservation efforts by the City. In addition, it is the intent of the ordinance to provide a means to protect the cultural, economic, and general welfare of the public through the preservation and protection of buildings, structures, **signs**, areas of historic and cultural interest within the City of Casa Grande.

Per the Historic Preservation Ordinance, 17.62.050A, the Commission may recommend to City Council that an individual property, site, **sign**, structure or object be designated as a Landmark if it:

1. Possesses special character or historic or aesthetic interest or value as part of the cultural, political, economic or social history of the locality, region, state or nation; or
2. Is identified with historic personages; or
3. Embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style; or
4. Is the work of a designer whose work has significantly influenced an age; or
5. Because of a unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood; and
6. The owner of the property, site, sign, structure or object concurs with the designation.

According to the above criteria, the Elks signs (BPOE Lodge) falls under the criteria of 1, 3, 5, and 6.

1. Possesses special character or historic or aesthetic interest or value as part of the cultural, political, economic or social history of the locality, region, state or nation; and
5. Because of a unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood.

The signs significance is tied to the Elks Lodge dating back to 1957. The signs have been located on Florence Blvd, a main throughfare of the area. This makes the signs a familiar visual feature of the Community and is tied to the social history or the region as well.

3. Embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style.

The Elks signs was surveyed in 2016 by Motely Design Group. The signs were classified Plaque/medallion/Channel Letters Building-mounted. The signs were recommended Contributes to Eligible NR Listed Property.

6. The owner of the property, site, sign, structure or object concurs with the designation.

The Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge is in support of preserving history and is supportive in designating the sign as a local historic landmark.

Sign Landmarks Criteria:

The criteria for eligibility used for the 2016 Sign Survey were patterned after the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) guidelines, with a few modifications for signs specifically. Other large scale sign inventories were also researched, and their guidelines were considered. For this survey, the individual signs were evaluated based on the following criteria:

- Over 40 years old
- Displays a unique or novelty design
- Displays good integrity where most the intrinsic elements of the design of the sign are present
- Contributes to context where sign enhances the environment or associated property/business in most cases the sign will be in its original location.

Based on the criteria for a landmark designation, the Elks Lodge Signs falls under all the required criteria.

Historic Preservation Code:

According to the Historic Preservation Code, 17.62.010A, the code declares that “as a matter of public policy that the **protection, enhancement and perpetuation of landmarks** and historic districts **is necessary to promote the economic, cultural, educational and general welfare of the public.**”

Staff’s Analysis:

Staff is in support of designating the Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge signs as a “local historic landmark”, due to the fact that it meets the above criteria for local landmark designation.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Commission forward a favorable recommendation for DSA-21-00113 to designate the “Casa Grande Valley Elks Lodge Signs” as a local historic sign landmark.

HISTORIC PROPERTY INVENTORY FORM - City of Casa Grande

PROPERTY IDENTIFICATION

2016 Sign Survey Site #: CGSS 76 Survey: Casa Grande Historic Sign Survey 2016

Previous Survey Site Number(s): none

Historic Name(s) of Associated Property: BPOE Lodge

Address: 909 E. Florence Blvd.

City / Town: Casa Grande Vicinity County Pinal Tax Parcel No.

Township: Range: Section: Quarter: Acreage:

Block: Lot: Plat (Addition):

UTM reference: Zone: 11 Easting: _____ Northing: _____

USGS 7.5' Quadrangle Map _____

ARCHITECT: UNKNOWN not determined known Source:

BUILDER UNKNOWN not determined known Source:

BLDG. CON. DATE: 1957 known estim. Source:

INSTALLATION DATE of SIGN: 1957 Sign Date Source:

CONDITION of SIGN

GOOD (well maintained; no serious problems apparent)

FAIR (some problems apparent)

POOR (major prob.; imminent threat):

RUIN or MISSING

USES / FUNCTIONS of Associated Property

Uses: Club/Community

Sources:



Date: 4/1/16 Comments/VIEW to: Southeast

2016 Sign Survey Site CGSS 76 Survey: Casa Grande Historic Sign Survey 2016



Date: 4/1/16

Comments East



Date: 4/1/16

Comments South

SIGNIFICANCE

Additional photograph page attached?: NO

A. HISTORIC EVENTS / TRENDS

Describe any historic events/trends associated with the property:

B. PERSONS

List and describe persons with an important association with the building:

N/A

C. ARCHITECTURE/DESIGN

Style: Plaque/Medallion/Channel Letters Building-mounted

NO Style

Four signs: "Elks" Script letters on façade and "BPOE" letters on side - both backlit channel letters; painted cast concrete - "BPOE 1957" medallion: freestanding metal box (circular on top of rectangular) on post

INTEGRITY

LOCATION Original Site Moved, on date:

from original site:

Describe the natural and/or built environment around the property::

How has the environment changed since the property was constructed?:

DESIGN *Describe alterations from the original design, including dates::*

RECOMMENDATIONS ON LOCAL ELIGIBILITY

Recommendation: Eligible

Reason: Contributes to an eligible NR Listed Property

FORM COMPLETED BY:

Name and Affiliation:: Robert Graham, Motley Design Group

Form Date:: 9/21/2016

Phone:: 602-254-5599